

Indian River County Florida

*Indian River County Administration Complex
1801 27th Street, Building A
Vero Beach, Florida, 32960-3388
www.ircgov.com*



Meeting Minutes - Final

Friday, March 3, 2023

1:00 PM

Special Call Meeting

Commission Chambers

Board of County Commissioners

Joseph H. Earman, District 3, Chairman

Susan Adams, District 1, Vice Chairman

Joseph Flescher, District 2

Deryl Loar, District 4

Laura Moss, District 5

Michael C. Zito, Interim County Administrator

Dylan Reingold, County Attorney

Jeffrey R. Smith, Clerk of the Circuit Court and Comptroller

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. ROLL CALL

Present: 5 - Chairman Joe Earman
Vice Chairman Susan Adams
Commissioner Joseph Flescher
Commissioner Deryl Loar
Commissioner Laura Moss

2.A. A MOMENT OF SILENT REFLECTION FOR FIRST RESPONDERS AND MEMBERS OF THE ARMED FORCES

2.B. INVOCATION

Christina Moore, Sr. Pastor, Rhema Apostolic International Deliverance Center

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Joseph E. Flescher

4. ADDITIONS/DELETIONS TO THE AGENDA / EMERGENCY ITEMS

A motion was made by Commissioner Flescher, seconded by Commissioner Moss, to approve the Agenda as presented. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

5. DEPARTMENTAL MATTERS

A. Human Resources

1. [23-0193](#) County Administrator Finalist Interview

Recommended Action: Staff respectfully requests the BOCC interview the finalists and a) vote to select the next County Administrator and authorize staff to extend a conditional offer of employment to include negotiation of an employment contract to be approved by the BOCC at a future meeting; or b) defer the County Administrator selection to the March 7, 2023 regularly scheduled BOCC meeting.

Attachments: [Staff Report](#)
[Straw Preference Poll for County Administrator](#)

Human Resources Director Suzanne Boyll announced the next phase of the finalist interview process for the candidates for County Administrator and turned the meeting over to Colin Baenziger, Executive Recruiting Consultant, Colin Baenziger & Associates (CB&A) to help guide the Board through the process.

Mr. Baenziger recalled the Board and the public had the opportunity to meet the candidates at the public reception held on March 2, 2023, and prior to this meeting each member of the Board met with the candidates individually for one-on-one interview. He explained the next process was to have each candidate come before the Board for questions in a 30 minute time frame.

Chairman Earman laid out the plan for the interview process and entertained the Board making their final selection at the end of the meeting.

During the interview process, the Board questioned each of the top five finalist candidates for County Administrator. Following is a summary of each candidate's opening/closing statements:

Candidate Dale "Doc" Dougherty addressed the Board and gave a brief background of his prior experience working in local government. He began his career in South Florida before pursuing a Master's in Business Administration at the University of Notre Dame. He stated the economic downturn led him back into local government in South Carolina, Georgia, Florida, and Michigan. He felt his strengths were his work ethic, integrity, customer service, his interpersonal skills, and the experience he gained by working and seeing different cultures and governments. Mr. Dougherty thanked the Board and ensured them that if he was chosen for the County Administrator position, he planned to stay as long as they would have him.

Candidate Jeff Wilkins addressed the Board and provided a brief work history in

local government as an Assistant Town Manager, City Manager, County Administrator, and presently the Director of Administration and Treasurer for the Solid Waste Authority of Central Ohio. He focused on his background in economic development, brownfield development, infrastructure agreements for water, budgeting, and intergovernmental relations, and was a County Administrator under ten County Commissioners. Mr. Wilkins thanked the Board for the opportunity.

The Chairman called for a recess at 2:25 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 2:30 p.m., with all members present.

Candidate Phil Matson addressed the Board and pointed out he was a 22-year resident of Indian River County, and prior to his position as the Community Development Director for the past three years, he was the Director of the Metropolitan Planning Organization. Mr. Matson touched on his former careers working at Broward County, a state agency and a port authority. He pointed out some of his strengths that qualified him for the County Administrator position was that he felt that he communicated well with the community, he had built bridges with the County's partner agencies at a state and local level, and he possessed knowledge of the other County departments. Mr. Matson always appreciated the support he had received from the Board and promised to bring to them an honest assessment in regard to the issues. He indicated that he would be able to devote a lot of time to the County Administrator position and conveyed his commitment of five years to the position. He concluded one of his priorities was to prepare a new generation of leaders, stating no organization should depend on one person. Mr. Matson thanked the Board for the opportunity.

Candidate Don Rosenthal addressed the Board and began with his career and educational background, noting that he had a Master's in Finance and Accounting. He discussed his time at Pasco County developing a permitting process and touched on issues such as septic to sewer conversion, processing permits and applications, strategic planning, employee recruitment and retention, and technology efficiency. He felt his experience could be beneficial to the issues the County was facing, and described what he would do if chosen for the County Administrator position. Mr. Rosenthal thanked the Board for the opportunity and had enjoyed speaking to them and meeting staff. He was very impressed with the County Department heads and staff, noting their appreciation for the County.

Candidate John Titkanich addressed the Board and began by thanking the Board for the opportunity, and he enjoyed meeting members of the community and staff at the public reception. He indicated that he had more than 24 years of combined experience working in local government for the City of Orlando, City of Cocoa, and St. Lucie County. He earned his Bachelor's degree from Florida Atlantic

University and has a Master's in Public Administration. He stated that his family chose to live in Indian River County because of the quality of life and was impressed with the investment the County had made in Parks and Recreation. He touched on the employee health clinic and the return on investment within the first year, and how the City of Cocoa incentivized their employees to utilize the clinic. He also discussed several economic development projects he had been involved with for the City of Cocoa, and his experience with annexations. Mr. Titkanich explained as the Director of Innovation and Performance Division for St. Lucie County, he reviewed all new budget requests to make sure they were aligned with their county's strategic plan, goals, objectives, and priorities. He thanked each member of the Board for their time, and Interim County Administrator Michael Zito, Human Resources Director Suzanne Boyll, and Acting General Services Director and Parks and Recreation Director Beth Powell for their efforts in the interview process, and as well as the members of the community who attended the reception at the iG center.

The Chairman called for a recess at 4:19 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 4:28 p.m., with all members present.

The Chairman turned the meeting over to Mr. Baenziger for the next step in the process for the selection of the County Administrator. Mr. Baenziger provided a ballot to each member of the Board and asked them to check off their top two choices for County Administrator. He displayed a summary of the Board's preferences.

	Adams	Earman	Flescher	Loar	Moss	Total
Dougherty			1		1	2
Matson			1	1		2
Rosenthal	1					1
Titkanich		1		1	1	3
Wilkins	1	1				2
						10

Mr. Baenziger read the results and suggested that since Mr. Rosenthal only received one vote, Vice Chairman Adams should choose a different candidate. Vice Chairman Adams stated she was not prepared to choose a different candidate at this time and would need additional time to go through her notes. A discussion followed with Commissioners Flescher and Loar stating the reason for their selection of Mr. Matson as their candidate, noting he had 20 years of experience with the County. Commissioner Moss sought and received information from Mr. Baenziger on the system used in the process of selecting a candidate. Vice Chairman Susan Adams requested additional time to evaluate the candidates and for the Board to make their decision at the Board's regular meeting on Tuesday, March 23, 2023. Chairman Earman felt the County needed

a new perspective and suggested making Mr. Titkanich, with the most votes, one of the top finalists. The Board should then vote for their next top finalist from the remaining four candidates. The Board submitted their votes for their next top finalist choice for County Administrator.

	Adams	Earman	Flescher	Loar	Moss	Total
Dougherty					1	1
Matson			1	1		2
Rosenthal	1	1				2
Wilkins						0
						5

Mr. Baenziger read the results, stating Mr. Rosenthal and Mr. Matson had both received two votes each, discussion followed on how to proceed. Both Vice Chairman Adams and Commissioner Moss felt the Board was being pressured to make a decision and agreed that they needed time to digest the information presented today and to resume the discussions at the Board's meeting on Tuesday.

A motion was made by Vice Chairman Adams, seconded by Commissioner Moss, to consider the results for the top selection of candidates for County Administrator to the March 7, 2023 Board Meeting. The motion failed by the following vote:

Aye: 2 - Vice Chairman Adams, and Commissioner Moss

Nay: 3 - Chairman Earman, Commissioner Flescher, and Commissioner Loar

Commissioner Moss turned to Mr. Baenziger in regard to the selection process as she expressed her concern that this procedure was not going to determine the best candidate for the County Administrator position. Vice Chairman Adams stated she would be willing to narrow the field down to two candidates, but was strongly opposed to making a decision at this time for such an important position.

County Attorney Dylan Reingold suggested if each Commissioner had two votes, there would be some coalescing around one individual candidate. A discussion followed on how to proceed with Commissioner Flescher pointing out the Board had ample time to review the candidate's information prior to the interviews. Commissioner Moss requested additional time to digest the information received from the candidate interviews. Chairman Earman suggested narrowing the candidates down to the top two finalists, and making the final selection for County Administrator at the March 7, 2023 Board meeting. He proposed the Board to vote for either Mr. Rosenthal or Mr. Matson, as one of the top finalists. Commissioner Moss expressed her concern that this method used to choose a candidate had not been tested prior.

Chairman Earman opened the floor for public comment.

Steve Myers, Teamsters Local 769, suggested narrowing the field by voting for either Mr. Rosenthal or Mr. Matson as their other top finalist.

Joseph Paladin agreed with statements by Commissioner Loar that the Board should not penalize an internal candidate who had been successful here in the County. He pointed out Indian River County was unique and that Mr. Matson had 20 plus years of experience in the County and was respected by the community, staff, and the Board.

There being no further comments, the Chairman closed the floor.

A motion was made by Commissioner Loar, seconded by Commissioner Flescher, to approve to vote for the second finalist from the top two vote-getters: Mr. Rosenthal or Mr. Matson. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Chairman Earman, Commissioner Flescher, and Commissioner Loar

Nay: 2 - Vice Chairman Adams, and Commissioner Moss

Mr. Baenziger distributed ballots to the Board to vote for either Mr. Rosenthal or Mr. Matson for the second finalist with the following results:

	Adams	Earman	Flescher	Loar	Moss	Total
Matson			1	1		2
Rosenthal	1	1			1	3
						5

Chairman Earman announced that Mr. Rosenthal would move into the finals with Mr. Titkanich and the Board agreed to wait until the March 7, 2023 Board meeting to make their selection for the County Administrator position.

A motion was made by Vice Chairman Adams, seconded by Commissioner Moss, to approve the Board to make their final decision for the County Administrator position at the Board's regular meeting on March 7, 2023, between the top two finalists: Mr. Don Rosenthal and Mr. John Titkanich. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Earman, Vice Chairman Adams, Commissioner Flescher, Commissioner Loar, and Commissioner Moss

6. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Earman thanked the Board, Interim County Administrator Zito, Human Resources Director Suzanne Boyll, and staff for all their work. There being no further business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 5:13 p.m.